



# PROCEEDINGS OF THE THIRTEENTH EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEETING

Manila, Philippines

28 – 29 October 2013









# PROCEEDINGS OF THE THIRTEENTH EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEETING

Manila, Philippines 28–29 October 2013

#### **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

			Page	
Execu	tive Sur	mmary		i
A.	Introdu	Introduction		
B.	Openi	ng of the Meeting		1
1.0	Establ	ishment of a PEMSEA Trust Fund		1
2.0	Status of the Selection and Recruitment of the Executive Director			2
3.0	Preparation for PEMSEA's Next Phase: Budget Status and Hiring of PRF Staff			
4.0	Other	Business		4
5.0 Closing of the Meeting		g of the Meeting		5
Anne	Y A S			
Annex		Meeting Agenda		6
Annex	x 2	List of Participants		9
Annex	<b>x</b> 3	Minutes of the Interview/Selection Panel for the Executive Director	r	12

#### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

The 13th Executive Committee Meeting was held at the Oakwood Hotel and Bulwagan Ninoy at the Protected Areas and Wildlife Bureau (PAWB) of the Department of Environment and Natural Resources (DENR), Manila, Philippines, on 28 and 29 October 2013, respectively. The DENR of the Philippines hosted the meeting. The meeting was attended by Amb. Mary Seet-Cheng, East Asian Seas (EAS) Partnership Council Chair; Usec. Analiza Rebuelta-Teh, Intergovernmental Session Chair; Prof. Chul-Hwan Koh, Technical Session Chair; Dr. Antonio La Viña, Council Co-Chair; Dr. Zhang Zhanhai, Intergovernmental Session Co-Chair; and Mr. Makoto Harunari, Technical Session Co-Chair. The Meeting was also attended by representatives from the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) Manila and a representative from the Republic of Korea as accompanying person of Prof. Koh. The PEMSEA Resource Facility (PRF) served as Secretariat to the Meeting.

The Meeting focused on the following key issues: establishment of a PEMSEA Trust Fund as a sustainable financing mechanism; selection of a PRF Executive Director; preparation for PEMSEA's next phase and ensuring continuity and sustainability of PEMSEA's operations, among others.

The Executive Committee (EC) reached the following major recommendations and requested the PRF to undertake the following:

- a. Prepare a concept paper on ways and means for developing, establishing and managing a trust fund/endowment fund to be presented on the next EC meeting;
- Coordinate with the State Oceanic Administration of China and Country Partners to develop project proposals for submission and consideration by the China-ASEAN Maritime Cooperation Fund Committee by 2014;
- c. Proceed with preparing and issuing PEMSEA contracts to PRF staff, whose contracts will terminate on 31 December 2013, to ensure seamless transition in PRF operations to the next phase of GEF support;
- d. Work closely with the DENR and the Department of Foreign Affairs (DFA) Philippines to ensure completion of the ratification process of the Headquarters Agreement by the second quarter of 2014;
- e. Finalize the hosting, venue and date for the East Asian Seas Congress 2015 and Ministerial Forum by the end of 2013, in collaboration with the Government of Vietnam.

The EC also decided that Mr. S. Adrian Ross, the Acting Executive Director and Chief Technical Officer of the PRF, be promoted to the post of PRF Executive Director for a one-year term with the possible extension, based on the outcome of the recently completed recruitment and selection process for the post.

\*\*\*

# PROCEEDINGS OF THE 13th EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEETING

#### Manila, Philippines, 28–29 October 2013

#### A. INTRODUCTION

- i. The Thirteenth Executive Committee Meeting was held at the Oakwood Hotel and DENR-PAWB Bulwagan Ninoy, Manila, Philippines, on 28 and 29 October 2013, respectively.
- ii. The Executive Committee meeting was attended by Amb. Mary Seet-Cheng, EAS Partnership Council Chair; Usec. Analiza Rebuelta-Teh, Intergovernmental Session Chair; Prof. Chul-Hwan Koh, Technical Session Chair; Dr. Antonio La Viña, Council Co-Chair; Dr. Zhang Zhanhai, Intergovernmental Session Co-Chair; and Mr. Makoto Harunari, Technical Session Co-Chair. The Meeting was also attended by Mr. Toshihiro Tanaka, Country Director of UNDP Manila; Mr. Michael Jaldon, UNDP Manila and Dr. Won-Tae Shin from RO Korea. The PRF served as Secretariat to the Meeting.
- iii. The full list of participants is given in **Annex 2**.

#### B. OPENING OF THE MEETING

- i. Mr. S. Adrian Ross, PRF Acting Executive Director, welcomed and thanked the members of the Executive Committee on behalf of the PRF. Mr. Ross also expressed appreciation to the DENR of the Philippines for their continuing support to PEMSEA and for hosting the 13th meeting of the Executive Committee.
- ii. Mr. Ross explained that the Meeting agenda and documents were kept brief by focusing on more substantive aspects that need to be addressed by the Executive Committee, leaving other items or administrative aspects that can be addressed through correspondence.
- iii. Amb. Mary Seet-Cheng served as Chair of the Meeting.
- iv. The Meeting adopted the agenda as presented. The agenda can be found in **Annex 1**.

#### 1.0 ESTABLISHMENT OF A PEMSEA TRUST FUND (EC/13/DOC/03)

#### **Discussion Highlights:**

- 1.1 The Meeting highlighted the following:
  - a. Voluntary contributions from countries signify ownership to PEMSEA and can provide significant support to the PRF Core Group and its operations.

- b. There is a need to continue to strengthen the ownership of countries for PEMSEA, and its value in helping to address transboundary and other environmental management concerns.
- c. It is important to actively market the value of PEMSEA in coastal and ocean governance, integrated coastal management (ICM), marine environmental protection, climate change, etc., in order to create buy-in and generate support for its sustainable operations.
- d. Establishment of a PEMSEA Trust Fund may be a useful way of strengthening PEMSEA's capacity to be a self-financing mechanism.
- e. An endowment fund is one approach that can be considered as it provides a mechanism or modality by which contributions will be used to capitalize a trust fund and earnings from interest can serve as source of finance for PRF Core Group operations.
- f. In establishing a PEMSEA Trust Fund, it is important to have a clear purpose for its use.
- g. The China-ASEAN Maritime Cooperation Fund may serve as a source of fund in support of some PEMSEA activities in the countries and for the establishment of a Trust Fund. The first round of projects under the fund is scheduled for 2014.
- h. It is essential to explore a range of potential contributors to a PEMSEA Trust Fund, including governments, private sector, foundations or even individuals.
- i. A number of other organizations/institutions (e.g., South Center, Intergovernmental Oceanographic Commission, World Climate Research Plan) have experience in developing such funds.

#### Recommendations:

The Meeting recommended that:

- 1.2 The PRF Secretariat prepare a concept paper on the development, establishment and management of a trust fund and present the results of the study in the next EC meeting, including the marketing of PEMSEA's uniqueness and value to countries and potential donors.
- 1.3 The PRF Secretariat coordinate with the State Oceanic Administration of China, through Dr. Zhang Zhanhai, and work closely with the countries in developing project proposals for submission to the China-ASEAN Maritime Cooperation Fund Committee by next year, including the establishment of a PEMSEA Trust Fund.

# 2.0 STATUS OF THE SELECTION AND RECRUITMENT OF THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR (EC/13/DOC/04)

#### **Discussion Highlights:**

2.1 The draft Minutes of the Interview/Selection Panel for the Executive Director (ED) Post, particularly the section on deliberation/recommendation, were discussed and modifications were suggested. In particular, it was emphasized that a key consideration of the Selection Panel was that an Executive Director needed to be highly familiar with the dynamics of PEMSEA and knowledge of and experience in the region, in order to facilitate successful completion of the ongoing transformation of PEMSEA.

- 2.2 The Interview/Selection Panel advised the EC that it was unable to recommend the selection of an Executive Director from the three candidates that were interviewed for the post.
- 2.3 The EC convened a closed-door session to discuss various options on how to best move forward.

#### Recommendations:

The Executive Committee recommended:

- 2.4 The adoption of the Minutes of the Interview/Selection Panel for the Executive Director Post as revised (**Annex 3**).
- 2.5 The promotion of Mr. S. Adrian Ross as PRF Executive Director for a one-year period with possible extension. In the meantime, the Executive Committee will continue to search for candidates for the post of PRF Executive Director.
- 2.6 To urge Country Partners to second officers to the PRF to gain experience in various PEMSEA operations.

## 3.0 PREPARATION FOR PEMSEA'S NEXT PHASE: BUDGET STATUS AND HIRING OF PRF STAFF (EC/13/DOC/05)

#### **Discussion Highlights:**

#### **Budget Status**

3.1 In view of the possible delays in the startup and availability of budget for the next PEMSEA project phase, the Meeting reviewed the current financial status of PEMSEA. The Meeting found that the remaining available funds would be sufficient to bridge the gap and ensure continuity in PEMSEA's operations.

#### Hiring of Staff

- 3.2 Beginning January 2014, PEMSEA will enter into a new phase and will be independent of the UN. In view of this, the following changes will be implemented:
  - a. All staff will be issued with PEMSEA contracts.
  - b. As an international organization operating in the Philippines, nationally recruited or local staff will be subject to tax derived from income. Since PEMSEA is not a withholding agency, the staff will be responsible for filing and paying their respective taxes.
  - c. The privileges and immunities of international staff will take effect upon ratification of the Headquarters Agreement by the Philippine Senate. In the interim, the DENR will endorse the international staff to the Bureau of Immigration to enable them to secure visas similar to a resident visa.
  - d. The DENR and PRF will update the current Memorandum of Agreement with PEMSEA to ensure that PEMSEA maintains its legal status while operating in the country.

3.3 The Headquarters Agreement is expected to be endorsed by the President of the Philippines to the Philippine Senate by the first quarter of 2014. The ratification of the Headquarters Agreement is expected by the second quarter of 2014 at the latest.

#### Recommendations:

The Meeting recommended:

- 3.4 The approval of the proposed budget for 2014 using the residual funds from the Regional Partnership Fund and the SDS-SEA Development Fund to bridge the transformation and ensure continuity in PEMSEA operations, with a view of reimbursing the funds upon availability of Global Environment Facility (GEF) project funds.
- 3.5 The PRF proceed with the process of contracting the current staff under the PEMSEA contract to ensure seamless transition in PRF operations. In the interim, all contracts will cover the first quarter of 2014.
- 3.6 The PRF work with the DENR and DFA to ensure completion of the ratification process of the Headquarters Agreement.

#### 4.0 OTHER BUSINESS

Draft Guidelines for PEMSEA Senior Advisers

#### **Discussion Highlights:**

4.1 In consideration of his contributions to PEMSEA, it would be most fitting to consider Dr. Chua as Chair Emeritus instead of Senior Adviser.

#### Recommendations:

- 4.2 The Executive Committee recommended the title of Chair Emeritus be adopted and that the PRF develop the Terms of Reference (TOR) accordingly.
- 4.3 The Executive Committee further recommended that a decision on the PEMSEA Senior Advisers proposal be deferred at present, and considered at an appropriate time in the future.

PEMSEA Participation in the GEF Council Meeting in November 2013

#### **Discussion Highlights:**

4.4 The 15-minute presentation allocated by the GEF to PEMSEA in the GEF Council Meeting in November 2013 will be a good opportunity to launch PEMSEA's 20th Anniversary publication. But most importantly, it provides an opportunity for PEMSEA to highlight its key achievements and milestones in the past 20 years. As GEF plans for GEF-6, it is a good opportunity for PEMSEA to present its future plans and targets as well.

#### Recommendation:

4.5 The Executive Committee recommended that Mr. Adrian Ross present the major achievements and future outlook of PEMSEA, together with the launching of PEMSEA's 20th anniversary publication during the 15-minute presentation at the GEF Council Meeting in November 2013.

EAS Congress 2015 and Ministerial Forum

#### **Discussion Highlights:**

4.6 The delay in the final and formal confirmation of Vietnam on the hosting of the EAS Congress 2015 and Ministerial Forum will impact on the preparations and promotion of the event. Thus, a meeting with Vietnam is urgent to confirm the venue, date and arrangements before the end of 2013.

#### Recommendations:

- 4.7 The Executive Committee recommended that the PRF meet and discuss with the Vietnam Administration for Seas and Islands (VASI) and secure Vietnam's confirmation for the hosting of the EAS Congress and Ministerial Forum, including the identification of the venue and date of the event to avoid delays in the preparations.
- 4.8 The Executive Committee requested the PRF to keep the EC members informed of the results of the discussions with VASI.

Documentation for Executive Committee Meetings

#### Recommendations

The Meeting recommended:

- 4.9 The PRF provide background documents on all items being discussed, including information agenda, to enable the Executive Committee members to prepare fully for the discussions.
- 4.10 The PRF simplify the meeting proceedings focusing on item discussed, summary or focus of discussions and actions required or recommendations.

#### 5.0 CLOSING OF THE MEETING

5.1 The Chair declared the meeting closed at 4:30 p.m., 29 October 2013.

\*\*\*

# ANNEX 1 MEETING AGENDA

#### 13th EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEETING AGENDA

#### October 28, 2013 (Monday)

Venue: Oakwood Premier Hotel, Ortigas

18:00 – 18:10 **1.0 Opening of the Meeting** 

18:10 – 20:00 **2.0 Establishment of a PEMSEA Trust Fund** 

The Meeting will address the rationale and actions required to establish and manage a PEMSEA Trust Fund, which will serve as a continuing source of revenue to support the operating costs of PEMSEA and the PRF Core Group.

#### October 29, 2013 (Tuesday)

Venue: Protected Areas and Wildlife Bureau (PAWB), Quezon City

09:00 – 11:00 3.0 Status of the Selection and Recruitment of the Executive Director

The Meeting will discuss the result of the selection and interviews conducted for the PRF Executive Director post. In view of the failure to select an Executive Director, the EC will identify measures/next steps and timetable for the recruitment process.

11:00 – 11:15 Coffee Break

11:15 – 12:30 **4.0 Preparation for PEMSEA's Next Phase: Budget**Status and Hiring of PRF Staff

In preparation for PEMSEA's entry into its new phase, the Meeting will review the following:

- (1) Status of the GEF/UNDP/PEMSEA Project Document on Scaling up the Implementation of the SDS-SEA
- (2) Budget for 2014
- (3) Hiring of PRF Staff

In view of the possible delays in the startup and availability of budget for the next PEMSEA project phase, the Meeting will review the status of PEMSEA's budget and various sources of funds. Various contingency measures will be explored to bridge the transformation and ensure continuity in PEMSEA's operations.

Concerns and steps to hiring of PRF staff for the new phase will also be discussed.

12:30 – 14:00 Lunch Break

14:00 – 15:30	Contin	uation of Agenda item 4.0
15:30 – 16:30		Other Business Draft Guidelines for PEMSEA Senior Advisers PEMSEA Participation in the GEF Council Meeting in November 2013

EAS Congress 2015 and Ministerial Forum

\*\*\*

# ANNEX 2 LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

#### **LIST OF PARTICIPANTS**

#### **EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE**

Amb. Mary Seet-Cheng
Chair
EAS Partnership Council and
Senior Specialist Adviser and
Non-resident Ambassador of Singapore to
Panama and Cuba
Ministry of Foreign Affairs
Singapore

Atty. Analiza Rebuelta-Teh Intergovernmental Session Chair, EAS Partnership Council and Undersecretary and Chief of Staff, Department of Environment and Natural Resources DENR Compound, Visayas Avenue, Quezon City

Prof. Chul Hwan Koh
Technical Session Chair
EAS Partnership Council and
Professor Emeritus,
School of Earth and Environmental
Sciences (Oceanography)
College of Natural Sciences
Seoul National University
Seoul 151-742
Republic of Korea

Atty. Antonio G. M. La Viña Co-Chair EAS Partnership Council and Dean, Ateneo School of Government Ateneo de Manila University Katipunan Avenue, Loyola Heights 1108 Quezon City

Dr. Zhang Zhanhai
Intergovernmental Session Co-Chair
EAS Partnership Council and
Director-General,
International Cooperation Department
State Oceanic Administration

 Fuxingmenwai Avenue Beijing People's Republic China

Mr. Makoto Harunari Technical Session Co-Chair EAS Partnership Council and Director, Japan Institution for Transport Policy Studies Japan

#### **UNDP MANILA**

Mr. Toshihiro Tanaka
Country Director,
UNDP Manila
30/F Yuchengco Tower
RCBC Plaza, Ayala Ave. cor. Sen. Gil
Puyat Avenue
Makati City

Mr. Michael Jaldon Environment Unit UNDP Manila

#### **OBSERVER**

Dr. Won Tae-Shin Republic of Korea

#### **SECRETARIAT**

Mr. Stephen Adrian Ross Acting Executive Director PEMSEA Resource Facility

Mary Anne Dela Peña Finance Specialist PEMSEA Resource Facility

Rachel Josue Senior Admin Assistant PEMSEA Resource Facility

Kathrine Rose Gallardo PEMSEA Resource Facility

Caroline Velasquez Executive Assistant PEMSEA Resource Facility Secretariat Coordinator PEMSEA Resource Facility Daisy Padayao Technical Assistant

#### **ANNEX 3**

# MINUTES OF THE INTERVIEW/SELECTION PANEL FOR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

### MINUTES OF THE INTERVIEW/SELECTION PANEL FOR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

### PEMSEA Resource Facility Manila, Philippines

### Held on 28 August 2013 via Skype

#### I. ATTENDANCE

Ambassador Mary Seet-Cheng (Panel Chair) Chair EAS Partnership Council

Undersecretary Analiza Teh Intergovernmental Session Chair EAS Partnership Council

Prof. Chul-Hwan Koh Technical Session Chair EAS Partnership Council

Mr. Stephen Adrian Ross (Secretariat)
Ms. Rachel Josue (Secretariat)
PEMSEA Resource Facility

#### II. OBJECTIVE

To interview the three (3) shortlisted candidates for the position of Executive Director for the PEMSEA Resource Facility (PRF).

#### III. BACKGROUND ON RECRUITMENT PROCESS

The Vacancy Announcement was released to Country and Non-Country Partners on 2 May 2013 and posted in the PEMSEA website, the International Institute for Sustainable Development, The Economist and ReliefWeb. The vacancy was also circulated to other networks and stakeholders. The PRF, as authorized by the EAS Partnership Council Executive Committee, received and screened all applications. As of the application deadline of 10 June 2013, a total of 33 applications were received with only three coming from the region, specifically, the Philippines. At the special EC Meeting held on 8 July 2013, the PRF presented all applications received including three recommended/short-listed candidates. The EC agreed with the recommendation and instructed the PRF to proceed in organizing interviews of the three short-listed candidates.

#### IV. CANDIDATES (Individual CVs attached as Annex A)

#### 1. Mr. Peter Wulf

- Australian, 47 years old.
- Masters of Laws; Ph.D. Candidate
- 25 years experience in providing strategic advice on environmental issues and the development of domestic and international law and policy implementation to governments throughout Australia, the Asia-Pacific and Caribbean/Central America.
- July 1987 to present Independent Consultant

#### 2. Dr. Eduardo Sabio

- Filipino
- Doctor of Philosophy
- 25 years of theory and practice in international development involving holistic and integrated community development, program development and management, rural and agricultural development.
- September 2009 to present Regional Representative in Vietnam of Vredeseilanden, a Belgian international nongovernment organization.

#### 3. <u>Dr. Hans Friederich</u>

- Dutch, 58 years old
- Ph.D
- Has held senior- and high-level posts for International Union for Conservation
  of Nature (IUCN) for the past 19 years and served as Senior Advisor for the
  Ministry of Science, Technology and Environment of Vietnam.
- 2009 to present Regional Director for Europe, IUCN Regional Office for Europe, Gland, Switzerland

#### V. PRE-INTERVIEW DISCUSSIONS WITH THE SELECTION PANEL

- 1. The pre-interview meeting started at 1:00 p.m., Manila time.
- 2. The Secretary informed the Panel that based on the approved TOR and grade, the salary level for the post is D1-D2 level. The final decision on salary level will depend on the applicant's qualifications, experience and current salary and benefits package.
- 3. For the conduct of interviews, it was agreed that the Secretary will give the opening statement and introduce the members of the Panel and candidates. He will then pass the floor to the Panel Chair.
- 4. The Panel will ask the same set of questions, with the Chair starting off with the first question for all interviews and rotating the other set of questions among the three members of the Panel at each interview.
- 5. The Panel agreed to rate the candidates based on the weight percentage identified for each competency as indicated in the rating/scoring sheet with a qualification threshold of 80 percent out of 100 percent.

- 6. Each interview with the applicants will run for 60 minutes.
- 7. The Chair requested the Panel to keep in mind that one of the qualities critical to the post is experience in fund mobilization. Another would be the applicant's managerial capacity.
- 8. After all interviews, the Panel members will deliberate on their impressions of each candidate and provide recommendation.
- The Secretary clarified that when the Panel is able to select a candidate suited for the post, the PRF will do reference checks and request the candidate for other evidence of competencies, as necessary, before a formal offer of appointment can be made.

#### VI. AGREED QUESTIONS AND SCORE

The agreed set of questions is appended as Annex B.

- Motivation 10 points
- Technical Knowledge and Regional Awareness 30 points
- Management and Coordination 30 points
- Building Trust, Leadership and Diplomacy 30 points

**Total Points:** 100 points

#### VII. INTERVIEW RESULTS

The results/responses of the individual interviews is attached as Annex C. The average scores and ranking of the three candidates is as follows:

Candidates	Total Score	Rank
Peter Wulf	68	2nd
Eduardo Sabio	67	3rd
Hans Friederich	80	1st

#### VIII. GENERAL ASSESSMENT PER CANDIDATE

Overall, the Panel finds that all candidates came prepared for the interviews, demonstrating their strengths and abilities in their own fields of expertise.

While Mr. Peter Wulf has good experience and understanding of natural resource and marine management, his working experiences are mostly on consultancy basis; in fact,

he is a consultant for most of his time. The ED post requires interaction, diplomatic relations and accountability with countries and stakeholders, and these are just some of the new challenges that Mr. Wulf may face, if he is to be considered for the post.

**Dr. Peter Sabio** knows the region well, is systematic in his planning approach, and his people relations is okay, but his experience and expertise is confined to agriculture and rural development. He has no background on ICM or any ocean and coastal management initiatives.

**Dr. Hans Friederich** has a good depth of understanding on how PEMSEA operates, although his professional experience is in watershed management and freshwater hydrography. However, he is not familiar with marine policy, coastal and ocean governance or the development and implementation of ICM programs. His fund mobilization skills and experience are evident; he can connect well with people and may help enhance PEMSEA's visibility.

#### IX. DELIBERATION / RECOMMENDATION

Based on the above results, there was no consensus on the selection of a candidate for the ED's post. The Panel concluded that it is crucial to give utmost consideration to the current situation of PEMSEA. Furthermore, it is critical that the ideal candidate be familiar with the dynamics of PEMSEA and has knowledge of and experience in the region to facilitate successful completion of the ongoing transformation process.

The Intergovernmental Session Chair expressed the position of the Philippine Government that if recruitment will not be successful, it would support the extension of the Acting Executive Director, Mr. Stephen Adrian Ross, until such time that a highly qualified replacement, who has knowledge of and experience in the region, is recruited.

The Secretary will revert to the minutes of the EC meeting concerning the ED recruitment and report to the Panel on the agreed actions. Meanwhile, the Panel will submit the interview scores of each candidate to the PRF, which will tally the ratings and prepare the proceedings of the interviews.

The report of the Selection Panel will be presented to the 13th meeting of the Executive Committee for review and consideration of options for moving forward.

Prepared by:

Stephen Adrian Ross Secretary

#### **CERTIFIED CORRECT:**

Ambassador Mary Seet-Cheng Undersecretary Analiza Teh Prof. Chul-Hwan Koh Chair